

BOARD OF POLICE COMMISSIONERS

Minutes of the Regular Board of Police Commissioners Meeting Thursday, April 15, 2004

The regular meeting of the Detroit Board of Police Commissioners was held on Thursday, April 15, 2004, at 3:00 p.m., at Police Headquarters, 1300 Beaubien, Rm. 328-A, Detroit, MI 48226.

ATTENDANCE

Board Members Present

Willie E. Hampton **(ABS)**
Arthur Blackwell, II
Erminia Ramirez
Jim Holley
Megan P. Norris

Department Personnel Present

Chief Ella M. Bully-Cummings
AC Walter Shoulders
AC Cureton
Cmdr. Godbee
Insp. Walter Martin
Insp. Jamie Fields
Insp. Janice Butler
Sgt. Quinn
Sgt. Debbie Jackson
Sgt. Gayle Smith
Sgt. Pride Johnson
PO Derrick Maye
PO Walter Huggins
Director Elsie Scott

Board Staff Present

Dante' L. Goss, Exec. Director
Denise R. Hooks, Attorney/Supervising Inv.
Arnold Sheard, Interim Chief Investigator
Ainsley Cromwell, Supervising Investigator

E. Lynise Bryant-Weekes, Personnel Director

OTHERS PRESENT

Ron Scott
Herman Vallery
Ms. Walters
Sandra Hines
Deborah Robinson
Rick Jones
Mr. Cracchiolio
Caroline Malkie

RECORDERS

Jerome Adams
Kellie Williams
Felicia Hardaway

1. CALL TO ORDER

Commissioner Blackwell called the regular meeting of the Detroit Board of Police Commissioners to order at 3:25 p.m.

2. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

- **Thursday, April 8, 2004**

MOTION: **Comm. Norris** made the motion to approve the minutes of Thursday, April 8, 2004.

SECOND: **Comm. Ramirez** seconded the motion

VOTE: All in attendance voted in the affirmative.

3. REPORT FROM THE CHAIR

Request for Hire

Minutes of the Regular BPC Meeting

Thursday, April 15, 2004

Page 3

Comm. Blackwell stated that Chief Ella Bully-Cummings is requesting that the Board approve the hire of Ms. Deborah Robinson as 2nd Deputy Chief. She will be replacing Director Elsie Scott, in the Training Bureau.

April 7, 2004

Board of Police Commissioners
City of Detroit
1300 Beaubien, Suite 328
Detroit, Michigan 48226

***SUBJECT:* REQUEST TO HIRE MS. DEBORAH ROBINSON, AS A
SECOND DEPUTY CHIEF OF THE DETROIT POLICE
DEPARTMENT**

Dear Board Members:

This letter serves as a request to hire Ms. Deborah Robinson, as a Second Deputy Chief, to head the Training Bureau of the Detroit Police Department, effective April 20, 2004. Dr. Elsie Scott, the current Director of the Training Bureau, informed me that she will be resigning, effective April 23, 2004. Dr. Scott will be relocating out of state. The disparity in the resignation and hiring dates will provide time for transition.

The Training Bureau is a significant entity within the Department in terms of moving it forward and ensuring Department personnel are updated within the law enforcement spectrum of training, certification, and professional development. The Bureau serves as the Department's principal training center. In addition to providing training for department personnel, the Bureau serves as the department's training liaison with other criminal justice agencies. All training conducted within the department is coordinated with the Training Bureau. This has been a long standing policy of the Department and is a requirement of the consent judgments in terms of training oversight and development. More specifically, the consent judgments provide that the Detroit Police Department coordinate and conduct regular (semi-annual) reviews of all training to ensure quality, consistency and compliance with applicable laws, the Michigan Commission on Law Enforcement Standards (MCOLES), and Department policy.

Additionally, the judgments provide that training in specific areas are administered to patrol officers, supervisors, and Department recruits on an

Minutes of the Regular BPC Meeting

Thursday, April 15, 2004

Page 4

annual basis—semi annual for firearms training. This methodology, as it relates to the frequency of training, assures that our members are updated on changes in various laws and other legal procedures. This equips our members with the skills, knowledge, and talent to provide competent service to our citizens and business in the city of Detroit.

Ms. Robinson, who retired as a Lieutenant with the Detroit Police Department in 1999, has been identified as the individual to replace Dr. Scott. As the attached resume indicates, Ms. Robinson is highly qualified—having served in management and administrative positions in the last 28 years. Ms. Robinson is currently employed with the MotorCity Casino as the Labor Relations Manager/Security Training Manager, and has been since her retirement from the Department in 1999. Ms. Robinson has served in adjunct teaching positions for the last 15 years at Northwestern University; Wayne, Oakland, and Macomb County Community Colleges; and Wayne State University.

While assigned to the Police Department, Ms. Robinson had an impressive career, working in all facets of operations—patrol, investigative, covert, administrative, and training. Ms. Robinson has 25 training certifications, to name a few: Critical Incident Management, Aerko Chemical Weapons Instructor, Cultural Diversity, Pressure Point Control Instructor, Accident Investigation, Spontaneous Knife Defense Instructor, Pressure Point Control Weapons System Instructor, and Precision Driving/Pursuit Driving Instructor.

In addition to being well-trained, Ms. Robinson is highly educated having earned her Bachelor of Science in Criminal Justice, Master of Science in Public Administration/Criminal Justice, and Master of Arts in Teaching—Education from Wayne State University. Ms. Robinson is a 1990 graduate of the Northwestern University School of Police Staff and Command where she also received the Franklin M. Kremel Leadership Award.

I am in the process of assessing the Department's allocation of personnel to ensure that there are a sufficient number of members assigned to patrol to enhance our service delivery to our citizens. I have determined that the Training Bureau will be downgraded to a "*Division*." This strategy will have no impact on the level of knowledge and expertise required of the individual to head the operation. It is imperative that progress and momentum at Training continue.

This introduction certainly demonstrates that Ms. Robinson is qualified to lead and continue progress in that area. I respectfully request your permission to hire Ms. Deborah Robinson as a Second Deputy Chief with the Detroit Police Department.

Should you have any questions or concerns, I am available at your convenience.

Sincerely,

ELLA M. BULLY-CUMMINGS
Chief of Police

EMB-C:jyb

MOTION: **Comm. Holley** made the motion to appoint Deborah Robinson to the position of 2nd Deputy Chief.

SECOND: **Comm. Ramirez** seconded the motion.

VOTE: All in attendance voted in the affirmative.

Comm. Norris addressed her question to Chief Ella M. Bully-Cummings. She stated it is clear from the resume of Ms. Robinson that she does have training background and has been on the faculty of several academic institutions doing training. One of her concerns, when she learned of the loss of Dr. Scott, is that under the Consent Decree, it is really critical that we have people with the ability to help develop curriculums for the various types of training that we need with things under the Consent Decree, which are sometimes more involved than just training them on how to use a firearm or training in how to do some particular task. She asked Chief Bully-Cummings if she could speak to the Board about Ms. Robinson's qualifications for helping us wade through that sort of thing, and why the Chief thinks this is the right candidate to bring forward at this time.

Chief Ella M. Bully-Cummings stated that she has several reasons. One, being that as a retired member of this department, who worked for a significant number of years in the training academy, she has a familiarity with the police department that would allow an opportunity for her to come back in and just go off running. She has been responsible for developing curriculums for a number of years for the different universities that she teaches at, where she is currently now, even though she is the Labor Relations manager. She was responsible for helping to design a curriculum for the Security Department at her current employer. She has a wealth of experience in doing that and I am very confident that she can come in... And let me say this, when I had discussions with her initially, she took it upon herself to go and print a copy of the Consent Decree and began reading it, even before we had a discussion about offering her this

position. To me, that spoke volumes and so based upon her prior skills, and her knowledge of the department, I think she is the best candidate. We really don't

have an opportunity with the two (2) Consent Decrees to bring in someone and give them an opportunity to get up to speed.

Comm. Norris stated I agree with that and timing is critical.

Chief Ella M. Bully-Cummings stated that it really is. As a direct result of her prior experience and her knowledge of the department, to me, she seems to be the best candidate. I did have a discussion with Dr. Scott and even though I hate to see Dr. Scott leave, we had a discussion and she has had some interaction with the former Lieutenant. Because one of the things that I wanted to make sure of was that Dr. Scott felt the individual that I was recommending to bring in would be able to handle that job and be very good at it.

Comm. Blackwell stated to Dr. Scott on behalf of the Board of Commissioners that the Commissioners appreciated all of her years of service here and her excellent work. We wish her well in her future endeavors. We would like to have a resolution prepared and have it approved at our next Board's meeting and pass it on to her.

4. SECRETARY'S REPORT – EXEC. DIR. GOSS

CITIZEN COMPLAINTS RECEIVED

Weekly Count of Complaints: 12 413

2003

During the past week: 21 Year to Date: 333

****Due to the database system being down, the actual breakdown of figures are not available.**

5. REPORT/PRESENTATION – CHIEF OF POLICE

Chief Ella M. Bully-Cummings stated that the Department unfortunately has lost three (3) police officers who passed away last night from cancer. Sgt. Bertha Parker, Property Unit; Police Officer Yvonne Lee, Special Operations at the 1st Precinct; and Police Officer James Mitchell, Gaming Unit. She stated that

Sgt. Parker she was aware of, and about a week ago, she was told that Sgt. Parker was diagnosed with terminal cancer and she did have an opportunity to

visit her at home and sit with her. She didn't realize that it would take her life so suddenly. She stated that Officer Mitchell was on one of the news stations yesterday. When she came to work yesterday, she learned that three (3) of our officers had passed away.

Chief Ella M. Bully-Cummings stated we have a citizen that was so moved by the loss of our officers, Jennifer Fettig and Matthew Bowens, that he took it upon himself to create a tribute to the officers and he would like to be able to present that to the Department here at the board meeting. I would like to introduce Mr. Stephen Reed. She stated that this speaks volumes for our young people here in the city and once you see this you will understand why. (Mr. Reed displayed the portraits of the officers.) She stated we will find an appropriate place in the Department to display the portraits. She thanked Mr. Reed on behalf of the Detroit Police Department.

Comm. Blackwell asked Chief Ella M. Bully-Cummings if the Board could receive the list of names of the officers who lost their lives to cancer. We would like to also put together a resolution memorial for their families, as well, and bring them forward to us for next week.

DETROIT POLICE DEPARTMENT

REPORT TO THE BOARD OF POLICE COMMISSIONERS

Vision Statement

BUILDING A SAFER DETROIT THROUGH COMMUNITY PARTNERSHIPS.

The Detroit Police Department is committed to uphold its mission to provide a safe environment for our residents and business. This effort is not possible without the joint commitment of the community and the Police Department.

ENFORCEMENT ACTIONS

On April 7, 2004, the Narcotics Enforcement Section conducted a narcotic blitz operation within the boundaries of the Eighth Precinct. There were a total of 31 enforcement actions, resulting in the following arrests and confiscations:

- ◆ 14 Felony arrests
- ◆ 32 Misdemeanor arrests
- ◆ 9 Juveniles detained
- ◆ 92.2 Grams of cocaine, 7.7 grams of heroin and 273.8 grams of marijuana – street value \$51,835.00

Minutes of the Regular BPC Meeting

Thursday, April 15, 2004

Page 8

- ◆ \$7,186.00 U.S. currency
- ◆ 5 Handguns
- ◆ 1 Vehicle
- ◆ 38 Miscellaneous Ordinances issued

On April 8, 2004, the Vice Section conducted an enforcement action within the boundaries of the First Precinct, resulting in the following arrest and confiscations:

- ◆ 1 Arrest for "Traffic Warrants"
- ◆ 16 Miscellaneous Ordinances issued
- ◆ 17 Detroit Tigers tickets confiscated

Additionally, on April 12, 2004, the Vice Section conducted a citywide vice enforcement operation, resulting in the following arrests:

- ◆ 24 Arrests for "Disorderly Conduct – Flagging"
- ◆ 24 Miscellaneous ordinances issued

FIFTH PRECINCT

On April 9, 2004, two robberies occurred, one at Taco Bell, located at 12200 Gratiot, in the Ninth Precinct and another at Wendy's restaurant, located at 17010 Harper, in the Fifth Precinct. Multiple updates on the description of the wanted subjects and vehicle were broadcast over the police radio. Officers of the Fifth Precinct while on patrol observed the wanted vehicle and conducted a traffic stop. One subject attempted to flee on foot but was apprehended after a brief foot chase. As a result of their investigation, four subjects were arrested for "Armed Robbery." Evidence and weapons involved in the armed robberies were confiscated and placed on evidence. Further investigation revealed that the subjects were wanted for "Larceny/Carjacking" in Eastpointe.

SIXTH PRECINCT

On April 10, 2004, a fatal shooting occurred within the boundaries of the Sixth Precinct. Officers of the Sixth Precinct responded and while conducting the

initial investigation, observed the wanted subject in the area where the shooting occurred. He was subsequently arrested without incident. On April 11, 2004, he was charged with "Murder First Degree and Felony Firearm." This capture probably prevented another life being taken.

ELEVENTH PRECINCT

On April 7, 2004, four (4) people (3 children and 1 adult) were shot while in their home. Eleventh Precinct officers interviewed witnesses and obtained a description of the wanted vehicle. Due to the combined efforts of the officers in the Eleventh Precinct and the community, the subject was located and arrested. On April 9, 2004, a warrant was issued charging the subject with six (6) counts of "Felony Assault, Discharge Firearm at a Building, Discharge From a Motor Vehicle, and Felony Firearm."

COMMUNITY RELATIONS

AVIATION UNIT

On April 10, 2004, officers of the Aviation Unit conducted a fly-over in observance of the City of Detroit Parks and Recreation Department 49th Annual Easter Egg Hunt. The egg hunt took place in the Fourth Precinct at Patton Park, located at Woodmere and Vernor.

MOBILE SUPPORT SECTION

During the week of April 7-13, 2004, officers assigned to the Traffic Administration Unit, trained crossing guards for their new positions. This training is a result of an ongoing recruitment effort being made in areas around public schools and through Channel 22, Public Service Announcements. For additional information regarding crossing guard positions, contact the Traffic Safety Unit, at 596-1457.

FIRST PRECINCT

On April 20, 2004, the First Precinct Community Relations Senior Spring Celebration will take place at St. Aloysius Community Center, located at 1209 Washington Boulevard, from 12:00 p.m., to 3:30 p.m. All are welcome to come out and enjoy the food and live entertainment.

EIGHTH PRECINCT

On April 13, 2004, the Eighth Precinct Junior Law Enforcement Explorers Post 808 hosted a fundraiser dinner at the Eighth Precinct. The purpose was to raise money for the explorers' physical training and defensive tactics gear. The event was a success.

6. PRESENTATION – FIELD TRAINING ADMINISTRATION UNIT

The presentation was given by Sgt. Gayle Smith and Sgt. Pride Johnson, Field Training Administration Unit.
(See attached)

Questions

Comm. Norris stated that a lot of helpful information has been given about what it takes to be a Field Training Officer (FTO), but could you tell us about what the FTO's actually do and what the training is. You mentioned that there are performance skills that the probationary officers are evaluated on and she does not have a good feel for what this training consists of or looks like. If you could help us out, that would be helpful.

Sgt. Gayle Smith stated that what the field officers do is there are ten (10) categories in which they evaluate the probationary police officers. They evaluate them on their uniform appearance, writing traffic tickets, writing reports, how well they handle prisoner processing, how they communicate on the radio to the zone dispatchers and other citizens, how they respond to their police runs, how well they preserve crime scenes, and ethics and conduct. There are ten (10) categories in which they evaluate them. The rating process is based on the department manual, so if the officer is not performing more than half of those tasks that I have identified on the evaluation form, then that officer fails that particular performance on that day.

Chief Ella M. Bully-Cummings stated to Comm. Norris that probably one missing piece is that they work together as scout car partners.

Comm. Norris stated so it is not a 3rd partner in the car, it is the second in the car.

Chief Ella M. Bully-Cummings answered that is right.

Comm. Norris asked so a probationary officer will be assigned the same person for some period of time?

Chief Ella M. Bully-Cummings answered right, a Field Training Officer.

Sgt. Gayle Smith answered they are partnered with that person for that 28-day work cycle.

Comm. Norris stated let's say I am really good at all of the technical things and I write all of the right things down but I am rude to the citizens or rude to Commanding Officers. If I am bad in one category, what happens to me?

Sgt. Gayle Smith stated that what happens is the Field Training Officer (FTO) will fail that probationary police officer in that particular category; that falls under Ethics and Conduct. That form is submitted to the Shift Supervisor, who will review the information, and the Shift Supervisor gets the opportunity to take that person out or he can monitor that officer more closely. Then this officer is put through remedial training.

Comm. Norris stated so if I am good in everything else, then I can have some focused remedial training on a particular area if there seems to be a problem in that area.

7. OTHER BUSINESS

Comm. Norris wished to congratulate Supervising Investigator Ainsley Cromwell (OCI) on the birth of his new baby son, Blair Cromwell.

Sensitive DPD Information leaked out to Radio Station

Chief Ella M. Bully-Cummings stated that a member of the Department provided a copy of a sensitive Detroit Police Department document to an AM radio host. She stated that yesterday morning the document was read line-by-line on the air. This 24-hour Major Incident Summary Report lists victims' names, addresses, and circumstances of the incident. She also learned that they are going to post this document on that radio host's website. She issued a teletype cautioning members of the department about releasing confidential, sensitive, law enforcement documents and prohibiting them from doing so and citing the specific directive and indicating that they would be subjected to disciplinary action. This morning on the radio, the host cited the teletype that I had written and what they failed to mention on the air. What they are calling this is crime statistics. These are not crime statistics, and we have absolutely no problem with releasing crimes statistics. We do it all the time. This morning on the radio, there was a discussion stating that we still have our source and this just goes to show that the Department is trying to hide something because they don't want to reveal the crime statistics. The radio station has vowed to continue to do that. She has restricted access to the 24-hour Major Incident Summary Report to Inspectors and above. Before, it used to appear on the Department's Intranet, so anyone who had access to a Department computer, could access that information.

Chief Ella M. Bully-Cummings stated that the reason that this is extremely important is because what happened yesterday was that this radio show host compromised the safety of citizens in this city. I will give you an example: there was a woman that fatally wounded an intruder into her home. In all probability, that will be considered a justified homicide. Her address and her name were read on the air. Now, the deceased person has a family and I am sure that in respect of the fact that he was committing a felony and was killed in the commission of that felony, they are grieving and they are hurting, and people have been known to retaliate. This woman's name and her address were read over the air. It is an invasion of privacy plus a lot of this information is preliminary. It is based upon the first responding unit's assessment of the scene prior to a complete investigation being completed. It is irresponsible and yesterday at the weekly press meeting that I have, I read a script indicating the irresponsible nature of that action, and asked that the radio host extend an apology. I guess that is not coming based upon what was said today. We are going to try and track how this information was released and take the most appropriate action against that Department member that we have available in our hands. We are law enforcement officers and our job is to provide the citizens in this city with safety and what the member on this Department did was compromise the police department, and what the radio show host did was compromise the citizens. It is important for me to have that put on record because it is going to be a continuous story going forward since they refuse to cease.

Comm. Holley asked should the Board take the action to write the memo or take the action rather than it be the Chief?

Comm. Blackwell answered that if it was an issue between the Department and the community, yes; but this is an issue between a breach of the rules within the Department.

Comm. Holley stated he is also talking about the community though.

Comm. Blackwell stated that someone in the Department is breaking the rules and giving something to somebody that is obviously saying they are not going to cooperate. Here is what my concern is: clearly there are people whose position is political and it has nothing to do with the integrity of the Department or anything because I think that everybody knows that this Chief is somebody who is doing her job and has a lot of integrity. We are just talking about names being released. This is not a scandal, this is about protecting individuals and if you had a family member that had gone through that, you certainly would not want their name released in anyway. The thing that I would ask the Chief is this has happened on a couple of occasions. I am asking is there a way to restrict this kind of information to persons and they bear some responsibility if this gets out, rather than this information goes out and nobody knows who does it. You go

through an exhaustive search but obviously if somebody is able to pull it off a computer, it is going to be very hard to determine maybe who did it at that level and I know you are talking about restricting it to Inspectors and up but this is not the first time this has happened. Sensitive information on a lot of levels like the Consent Decree and other things keep getting out and I am saying that the city is liable for a lot of money and lot of problems when stuff gets out before it is even policy. What kind of rules and regulations or penalties does this Board as a policy need to look at as it relates to the Department? Obviously, you may have everything at your disposal but stuff like this concerns me because this is not about personality anymore. Somebody's name gets read over the radio on something like that, it offends everybody. I don't care who you are for or who you are against, I think what happened is that caution is being thrown into the wind now because of certain people taking positions on different things and I think we should really get out of that business. So, I am asking you are there things that this Board can do along Rev. Holley's line in terms of any kind of rules and regulations or get with the City Council because this is an issue that is not the first time from what you are telling me, it won't be the last. If this is going to keep going on, it is really going to undermine all of the efforts that are trying to be made to rebuild this police department. That is not what it is about. If you don't like somebody, there is a process to deal with that and there is this process. People can come and address any issue at this process but there are certain stuff and I think if we will all agree, this is sensitive to the families and to individuals security and protection especially there are people who are afraid everyday and you can put somebody's name out on the radio, that is just a serious to me. I guess Chief, is there anything and I know you are looking into it but is there anything that we could be doing a little more proactive from this stand point to deal with that.

Chief Ella M. Bully-Cummings stated probably not, I just wanted to make the Commission aware that there is a policy. We have a policy on... [REDACTED] ... with the Department. What may prove very tenuous is identifying who actually did it. I am attempting to address directly with that radio station my concerns in writing.

Comm. Holley stated that is my point. I don't feel like this should be a match between the Chief and a radio personality of the station, that should be the Board's fight and I am asking from the Commission members that have all of the experience should the Board issue a press release or something because citizens' lives have been put in danger with this and we have an obligation. I think that is something the Board should be doing to the radio station. The Chief takes care of the police people and somehow we take care of the community.

Chief Ella M. Bully-Cummings answered right.

Comm. Holley stated I am just asking Mr. Chairman.

Comm. Blackwell stated that it would not hurt for the Board to take a position on what the Chief said, but I just think what she is saying in front of the public today inside of the Department that there are individuals who have made a pledge and a vow to continue to undermine the rules and regulations of the Department.

Comm. Norris stated that we can do something with regards to the radio station; but we have to be a little bit careful because assuming that the Chief is able to identify the individual, I imagine the disciplinary action at some point will find its way to the Board. We then act on those disciplinary actions and we don't want to be in a position where it looks like we have pre-judged or pre-determined what we would do or what the facts are or anything like that because we will have a role in the disciplinary process. I want to say to you, Chief, that I really appreciate these kinds of updates of information that we can get before we read about it in the paper or before it blows up because these are the kinds of things that we always get calls on and it is really helpful to have you let us know before things are five alarm fires.

Chief Ella M. Bully-Cummings stated I tried listening to the radio as much as I could this morning. I had things to do and someone else recorded it for me and not too long ago, brought it to me and that is how I knew what was said today. I thought maybe yesterday that information would have gotten back and they would have said okay, we made an error, we should not have done that, but they are going forward based upon what was said today.

Comm. Blackwell stated that the nature of the media or radio, if they get some information, they are going to run with it. That is the nature of the media and radio but my issue is how the information gets out. I think there has to be a message sent that anybody that undermines the integrity and the rules and regulations of the Department with stuff that could actually put people in jeopardy, we need to have the highest form of punishment and let people know. Maybe, there needs to be a 911 Commission, there needs to be an inquiry into this at the highest levels to get to the bottom of this. I think that it is a good idea to start restricting the intelligence and the information. Obviously, understanding politics like I do, you have to always be very careful not trying to restrict people's rights to know what people have a right to know. It is like free speech is not protected when you run into a theatre and say fire. If you want to raise some statistics that you think somebody may be hiding, you have a right to do that, but if you start reading people's names, then you are putting people in jeopardy, and that is what my issue is. That just cuts across the line. Good luck on trying to get folks to work with you. I don't know if that is the issue. My issue is trying to find a way to investigate it in such a way that the penalty is very certain and severe and swift and that people will know that you are going to be very diligent about going after whoever did this and folks that may or may not be responsible for this.

Comm. Ramirez stated you have our support. You have to do what you have to do.

Chief Ella M. Bully-Cummings stated that we are doing all that we can to try and identify who is responsible for this on the part of the Department member. And let me just say that I am so angry by the irresponsible act on the member of the Department that, to me should we identify who it is, there comes a point and time when a member's conduct is so egregious that there is no longer progressive discipline that it goes from square one to square ten. I think that this is one of those cases where we would be justified in doing it. I hope that we can find the culprit. I just wanted to make you aware of it because we have no problem with sharing crime statistics with the public. We have that obligation and this is their city and they need to know what is going on but we need to be very careful about putting peoples' names and addresses out there. We had a number of deaths in that 24-hour period, and we did not even have an opportunity to notify next of kin because it was done over the radio.

Comm. Ramirez stated that if the radio shows want crime statistics, I don't think it is any crime to provide it to them.

Chief Ella M. Bully-Cummings stated that you can get that through the Internet.

Comm. Holley stated that it does not have the drama.

Comm. Ramirez stated that as a Board, we represent the citizens and the citizens are out there and they are listening to this. For those that receive the Board minutes. Also, I would hope that the citizens and organizations will get together and start writing letters to this particular radio show.

Comm. Holley stated he is asking for a little bit of consideration that the Board represent the community and that is why we are here; not just to hear people that come up here with their various concerns. Sometimes their concerns are in conflict with people that we have to make a decision about. I think the Chief does what the Chief is supposed to do and that is policing. I think Mr. Chairman that somehow if this has compromised a public safety, we have an obligation to speak out. Maybe the people don't know how dangerous this is and maybe the people that listen need to know.

Comm. Ramirez suggested a letter on behalf of the Board.

Comm. Holley stated that the Chief should not be dealing with this, she has her job inside and our job is outside.

Comm. Ramirez asked Comm. Holley is that what you are asking?

Comm. Holley answered that is what I am asking.

Comm. Ramirez asked a letter on behalf of the Board?

Comm. Holley stated that he is just asking for the Board members who have the experience to put something.....

Comm. Blackwell stated that he thinks on something like this, we could adopt a position and say that we absolutely disagree with anyone who uses this personal information in a way that is detrimental in conflict of rules. Obviously, the Board adopt rules and we set the rules so they are conflicting one of the rules that we say we concur with. I don't have a problem with Rev. Holley making a statement on behalf.....

Comm. Holley stated that the Board should be mad because the Chief is mad because people's lives have been put in danger and that the public needs to know how dangerous this is.

Comm. Norris stated that I think what we can do.....

Comm. Holley stated not so much for the radio person but the people that she is talking to.

Comm. Norris stated that I think what we can do.....

Comm. Holley stated this is not right. We might be excited about this and call in but the danger of this, I think, it changes things. I think that is our fight and not the Chief's fight.

Comm. Norris stated that I think that it is also the Chief's fight because they are using departmental information. I think it is perfectly appropriate and the Board has to be very careful to stay away from the disciplinary issue until they come to us. I think that the Chief knows how we feel about things but we need to not pre-judge any disciplinary matters that are not before us. It is perfectly appropriate for the Board to write a letter to the radio station saying that on behalf of the citizens that we are very concerned and we can publicize that letter. I think that would be fine but I think that we need to stay away from what will happen departmentally until that comes up. I think the appropriate thing to do would be to direct our Executive Director to draft a letter and the Chairman of the Board can review it and make sure it is appropriate, and assuming that it is, it can go out.

Comm. Blackwell stated that he agreed and we need to be emphatic because we are really defending more than anything, it is not just what the specific incidents are, we believe someone is violating rules and our job is to defend the rules of your job. I think we should say something about that.

Comm. Holley stated thank you for your patience.

Comm. Blackwell stated to the Chief that the Board appreciated that and that he thinks the underlying message that Rev. Holley is saying more than anything is that you have to do what you have to do and we support that. You have to go through your process but we don't really want to see you engaged as our Chief with a radio station that may be futile. I am not saying that is, you still have to send out whatever you have to do but our issue is that the Board has to stand up and protect the integrity of the Department by saying this is what it should be and anything other than that is not in the people's best interest.

8. ORAL COMMUNICATION FROM THE AUDIENCE

Ron Scott stated that he did not believe that the standard for access to information regarding the Consent Decree falls within the same context. In fact, it has been one of our pre-spoken concerns that the information regarding the Consent Decree and reports has not been accessible enough to people who have advocated for change in this Department. It should not be something which is exclusive for a certain period of time to the Police Department and to the Police Commission. It should be made available post haste immediately right after it is done and those reports are rendered to the public. It should not have been necessary for the press to have gotten it before because we wait too long for that kind of information to have been rendered.

Comm. Norris stated that this is one where the Department does not have a lot of say. The Consent Decree process, as I understand, is that the Department submits its quarterly report to a Monitor, and the Monitor prepares a quarterly report a draft of which goes to the Department of Justice and then to our Department. Those two (2) parties then respond and then the Monitor finalizes the report. In the previous quarter, the draft Monitor Report was released to a reporter prior to it becoming final. It is our understanding that it did not come from this Department; we believe it came from the Department of Justice. But I will tell you, that everybody that had access to that information, got a lot of heat about that from the Monitor and through the federal judge involved to the point that the federal judge decreed that the next quarterly draft report was going to go to very limited people who had to sign for it and had to then disclose every single person they released it to so that if that happened again, the federal judge would call the right person in. I am the liaison with this Commission and the Consent Decree, and I did not see the draft this time because it was very careful. That is not this Department or this Commission trying to withhold information, that was coming from the judge.

Ron Scott stated that he was just mentioning the information. He stated that he knows Julian Cook very well. As I told him at the time, I thought that the fact that

the public was not included in discussions at the table was commensurate to George Wallace standing in the door at the University of Alabama. He and I know each other very well. You do not deny information and the fact that the reactive stance of even denying it to a greater degree only exacerbates the presumption that many citizens have that report and information are not adequate in a timely fashion in terms of being released.

Comm. Norris stated that you can have that argument with Judge Cook and that is fine but nobody in this Department or this Commission is going to knowingly violate Judge Cook's directives.

Ron Scott stated he was just responding in reaction to his friend's response. It did not rise to the standard of information that is released in terms of the public.

Comm. Blackwell stated that the only difference is what he said and what he stands by is that nothing will be approved by this Commission that is not thoroughly exhausted by the community.

Ron Scott asked can we help you exhaust it?

Comm. Blackwell answered yes. To the extent that you and I have talked about the more citizens' input, I think that is been the one sore spot with me. There is a lot more experience in the audience than there is up here on the Board. The fact is we are not taking advantage and that is why I thought we had this Commission. We have these meetings and what you say is ground zero and not from a policy, not from what somebody says, what people have experienced, what people believed or what they know. If that is not incorporated into the overall thing, it will not work. On the other side, I believe Comm. Norris is saying that this process of the Consent Decree and the Department and whatever they are doing is fine. I don't care what they agree on, before it is finally adopted, we must vote for it. Before that happens, there is going to be an exhaustive, a real town hall, workshop type session where people can have some input because if that is not in it, its not going to really be worth the paper it is written on, in my opinion. If the community doesn't buy into it, it not really going to legitimate, so from that standpoint, I think we are saying the same thing.

Ron Scott stated that the Commission might want to make a statement on the access to this information and how it is rendered. I think it would be important for the Commission to emphasize what you are saying as to say that this process even though it was compromised from his prospective. We still need the latitude to make sure that the citizens have as close to a immediate access to this information as possible.

Comm. Norris stated I will go one step further; I think frankly, that all of those communications that we talk about should be public. I think that what our

Department says in a quarterly report about what progress we have made is as important to me as what the Monitor ultimately finds. I would advocate that all of the official, not the day-to-day working things, but the official communications from our Department to the Monitor about our quarterly progress and from the Monitor back, I think that all of those should be public. I am simply saying that the judge ruled that they are not and our Department thinks from what I have been able to tell has tried real hard to comply with that withstanding the nature of the leaks and the like. I am supportive of our Department in following the judge's order but I agree with you. As a Commissioner, I am unable to find out what our Department says we have succeeded at or failed at and I think that is not right, but that is where we are right now.

Ron Scott stated that to the degree that the Department succeeds or fails, I think that a large degree is predicated on how much information and involvement citizens have in terms of transforming this Department and helping you transform it. That information is not available will make it very difficult and I think a letter to that degree would be more than appropriate to come from the Commission because that is the key factor that I am saying here. If you don't have input, you can't have access. If you don't have access, you can't have input.

Caroline Malkie alleges that a police task force surrounded her home and banged on her doors while she was at work according to her neighbors. She stated that they were looking for an assailant who had assaulted her daughter in 1996 and this individual had skipped probation. She was trying to understand why they came to her home. She has been calling the precincts and the problem is still not resolved.

Chief Ella M. Bully-Cummings stated that first of all, we have to determine that it was the Detroit Police Department and I did not hear you say that. I heard you say that...

Caroline Malkie stated that she was not sure because the neighbors said they banged on the door and had on totally black clothing and in a black unmarked car. I tried the Wayne County Sheriff's Office and they stated it was not them. I called the DRANO Unit and they said it was not them. I have talked to officers at the Eighth Precinct and stated it was not them. No one is telling me that this run is on their sheet.

Chief Ella M. Bully-Cummings stated that Inspector Butler can take the information and the location and we can check the Department's records, and if in fact, that it was the Department, it may not have been out of the precinct, and so that is what we need to take a look at.

Mr. Cracchiolio addressed an article that was in the Free Press concerning violence in the city of Detroit.

Comm. Blackwell asked if the reporter was justifying or just making an observation?

Mr. Cracchiolio stated that the observation seems to justify that. He wanted to know if anyone knew him and is he funded by Detroit?

Comm. Ramirez stated it was a good question for you to investigate that because I would like to know what kind of research he did. But I would, if I were you, I would try to track him down through that and find out what the ..(audible)

Mr. Cracchiolio answered why should I have to track him down? I am asking the Board, and you are the agency.

Comm. Blackwell stated that he did not actually commit a crime and we don't go after folks for making idiotic statements. Clearly, there are people who have disparity with Detroit for a long time with very inaccurate statements and this is no exception. I have not read the article and not knowing what the Chief has said in the article. I do know that there is a relationship sometimes between unemployment and crime going up. It is not to justify it but there is an inverse relationship. Now the issue is that violence and some of the other drug and alcohol is another component of society that may not have anything to do with that. But, the point is if someone made a statement like that, maybe it is trying to help youths and they see a lot of youths who come in that and that the unemployment rate among youths is somewhere around 45% in the city of Detroit. For those who are eligible, that is a very significant unemployment rate when you have an economy that has been very sluggish and you have the issue of Bush talking about the jobless recovery. There is a great deal of frustration as a result of what is going on. You have billions of dollars being made by these corporations and then you come into the communities and there is no work or not jobs. Not to justify his statement because I wouldn't do that. But at the same time, understandings that somebody may be dealing with youths and the kind of things those youths are telling people today. They are saying that it is so bad out there that they have given up. Teen suicide is up and there is a lot of depression of there. Does that justify it? No. But as a condition, maybe of some of the variables and circumstances in society, it maybe something that needs discussed so we would dismiss him saying that it is justifiable because it is never justified but not to know the full context of what he meant. He may be a very caring individual and just trying to do something to help youths that are running into a lot of negative feedback that he is getting when he goes out and tries to do something. There are a lot of people out there that have degrees and skills and still can't get a job. You think about somebody who may just be finishing high school, looking for some meaningful work and they can't get it. They may have a family to take care of and times in Detroit are best as they have ever been.

Mr. Cracchiolo stated that he believed there is no justification for crime and that this statement is an insult to the people of Detroit who are law abiding citizens.

Ms. Walters expressed her concerns that some of these immunizations are being put into the children and to the public and the results and behavior are being studied.

Comm. Norris stated that our web page shows our regular schedule and the precinct where the Community Meeting is being held but does not give the address. Could the address be posted on our website so that citizens would be able to access Map Quest to get directions to the community meetings?

Executive Director Goss answered yes, we can do that.

Comm. Norris answered that would be very helpful.

Comm. Blackwell asked if that is the primary way that we get the information out to the public?

Comm. Norris answered I don't know. She asked Ms. Walters how does she find out where our meetings are?

Ms. Walters stated that she goes into the Board office and asks the ladies. If it is early enough, I just find it.

Comm. Norris stated that I think we need to improve that.

Comm. Blackwell asked what is our delivery mechanism for letting the general public know where the meetings are, especially in the precincts that we may be going to?

Comm. Norris asked about the Community Meetings that are not regular meetings?

Comm. Blackwell asked is there any kind of newsletter that goes out from the precinct prior to the meeting?

Ms. Walters stated that what she thinks should happen is like that information got to the radio show, we should begin sending all the radio talk shows.....

Comm. Blackwell answered Public Service Announcements (PSA)

Ms. Walters answered that is right and they would give that announcement out.

Comm. Blackwell stated that is a good idea.

Comm. Norris stated it should be posted in this building and it should be on our web page.

Comm. Blackwell stated I think where people are, they will listen to the radio.

Comm. Norris stated right and the precincts.

Mr. Cracchiolio stated it should be in the daily paper.

Comm. Norris stated that anywhere we can publish free information about the meeting. I think that is a big issue because it is not easy to find out. The precincts do different things. Some precincts do a very good job of getting the public in those precincts informed. I have never learned about a meeting in my precinct except through my position on the Commission. I think that is an area we need to work on.

Ms. Walters stated and all of the churches.

Mr. Cracchiolio indicated that there is a place in the daily paper that lists community events.

Comm. Blackwell suggested to Executive Director Goss that he come back with uses and sources of how we can get the word out about our Board meetings. He stated to come up with some ideas and let us think about it.

Ms. Walters suggested that there is a WXYZ Community Calendar.

Comm. Blackwell stated that is WXYT and she is on the radio.

9. ANNOUNCEMENT OF NEXT MEETING

Thursday, April 22, 2004, @ 3:00 p.m.
Police Headquarters
1300 Beaubien, Rm. 328-A.
Detroit, MI 48226

10. ADJOURNMENT

Meeting was adjourned at 4:35 p.m.

Respectfully Submitted,

DANTE' L. GOSS
Executive Director
Board of Police Commissioners

DLG/fyh